# F2: Con

## F2: H-4 Visas

## F2: Squo is solving/U-Visas

#### Rediff News reports that many women don’t know about the existence of these possible solutions, so it doesn’t help them at all. The India Tribune confirms that H4 immigrants don’t know about the Violence Against Women Act or any similar protections in America. You cant use something you don’t know about.

#### But even if they used these solutions, they would have to get divorced to be independent. Unfortunately, Mukherji 2017 explains that divorce in India is very taboo and very unlikely to be considered. Their culture of divorce is much more strict and criticized than ours. But even if you believe they will use these visas,

#### This will not work, and the women know this. The way they say the status quo is solving is through U-Visas which only allow these women to work for 4 years in the US. Thadani of the San Francisco Chronicle explains that Indians with Bachelor’s degrees have to wait anywhere from 25 to 70 years for a green card. For these women, it means they must wait much longer than 4 years to receive this green card since they don’t meet the Special Immigrant status the US looks for, if they did they would be the one with the H-1B visa.

#### Shepard from PubMed Central finds that A bill alone will not help in preventing domestic abuse; what is needed is a change in mindsets. These laws aren’t implemented well, so it rarely prevents domestic abuse, and doesn’t at all solve for the root of the problem.

#### This response actually affirms our side. All Law continues that the easiest way to reach a green card is by being the relative or spouse to someone with US citizenship. The women will stay with their abuser because it’s the only way they believe they can fulfill their American Dream. By voting pro you are allowing more and more women to be trapped in this domestic abuse by promoting the false belief that they can reach the American Dream when instead they are only getting put down and abused.

Ilona Bray, 2017, "Why Is The Wait For a Green Card So Long?," AllLaw, http://www.alllaw.com/articles/nolo/us-immigration/why-the-wait-green-card-so-long.html

There are limits on the number of U.S. green cards (lawful permanent residence)  made available under the U.S. immigration laws, at least in certain categories. For many would-be immigrants, this means they must wait after applying - sometimes up to ten years - to become eligible to become a permanent resident.

What Are The Categories?

No limits apply to the number of green cards that can be issued to immediate relatives of U.S. citizens. Immediate relatives include the U.S. citizen’s [parents](http://www.alllaw.com/articles/nolo/us-immigration/how-to-get-green-card-for-your-parents-citizen.html) (if the citizen is over age 21), [husband or wife](http://www.alllaw.com/articles/nolo/us-immigration/filing-petition-i-130-foreign-spouse.html), and [unmarried children under the age of 21](http://www.alllaw.com/articles/nolo/us-immigration/getting-green-card-your-minor-child-citizen.html). Similarly, no limits currently apply to the number of people who can gain a green card based on [asylee or refugee status](http://www.alllaw.com/resources/immigration-law/asylum). (This is a change from past law.)

Green cards allocated annually to [employment-based categories](http://www.alllaw.com/resources/immigration-law/employment-based-immigration-laws), including investors and **Special Immigrants**, number 140,000 worldwide. Approximately 480,000 green cards worldwide can be issued each year in the family categories.

Only 7% of all worldwide preference visas can be given to persons born in any one country. There are, therefore, two separate quotas: one for each country and one that is worldwide. This produces an odd result, because when you multiply the number of countries in the world by seven (the percentage allowed to each country) you get a much larger total than 100.

What this means from a practical standpoint is that the 7% allotment to each country is an allowable maximum, not a guaranteed number. Applicants from a single country that has not used up its 7% green card allotment can still be prevented from getting green cards if the worldwide quota has been exhausted.

[…]

Of course, in the family based preference categories, maintaining your eligibility can sometimes be a challenge. If, for example, you are trying to immigrate as the unmarried child of a lawful permanent resident, you will need to [make sure not to get married](http://www.alllaw.com/articles/nolo/us-immigration/why-children-must-remain-unmarried-until-green-card-approval.html) until after you have received your U.S. green card.

It May Be Possible to Shorten the Wait

In other situations, however, it’s possible to shorten your wait. For example, if you are the spouse of a lawful permanent resident, and that person becomes a U.S. citizen, then you become an immediate relative and can proceed with your green card application.

#### **The USFG H-4 protection policies promises not moving; most say nothing will materialize**

Nate Swanner. "Trump Administration Going After H-1B Spouses." *Dice Insights*. 19 Dec. 2017. Web. 22 Mar. 2018. <https://insights.dice.com/2017/12/19/h-1b-spouses-h-4-work/>

As many wait for the Trump administration to [make a big move](https://insights.dice.com/2016/11/30/trump-kill-h1b-program/) on H-1B visas, it seems the government is going after those related to visa holders. Spouses of H-1B visa holders are the target this time. Trump’s White House [plans to eliminate a provision](https://www.reginfo.gov/public/Forward?SearchTarget=Agenda&textfield=1615-AC15) that allows those who are married to H-1B visa holders to work stateside under the H-4 visa while the H-1B holder is navigating the green card approval process. The Department of Homeland Security (DHS) didn’t say why it was moving forward with this proposal now, only citing the “Buy American, Hire American” executive order Trump signed in April. A formal process for revoking H-4 visas hasn’t been initiated. However, the move already has some wind at its back. Well before the executive order, a group called ‘Save Jobs USA’ petitioned to have the Obama-era rule about H-4 visas reversed. This group is made up of former tech employees who claim to have lost their jobs as a direct result of the H-1B visa. It’s a terse back-and-forth, with Save Jobs USA [asking](http://immigrationimpact.com/2015/09/02/restrictionists-continue-to-attack-h-4-work-authorization/) for congressional intervention: The case was [dismissed with prejudice](https://www.pacermonitor.com/public/case/8087969/SAVE_JOBS_USA_v_US_DEPARTMENT_OF_HOMELAND_SECURITY) in September 2016, and is currently tangled in the appellate process. It’s not the only legislative action focused on visas; earlier this year, Congressman Darrell Issa (R-California) and Representative Scott Peters (D-Calif) took aim at the structure of the visa program via the [Protect and Grow American Jobs Act](https://insights.dice.com/2017/01/11/h-1b-trump-white-house/).U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS), a division of DHS, [recently made it tougher](https://insights.dice.com/2017/11/15/h-1b-visa-applications-tighter-review/) to have H-1B visas renewed for existing workers. An uptick in RFEs, or “requests for evidence,” signaled that the government agency was starting to monitor H-1B visas. Premium processing for H-1B was also halted. Hardest hit by this proposal may be Indian women. An estimated 80 percent of H-1B recipients come from India, and roughly 90 percent of the 36,000 H-4 holders are women. It’s worth noting that the DHS is only calling its shot, as there’s currently no formal rule change in place. This proposal also doesn’t prohibit spouses from traveling with H-1B visa holders; it only removes their right to work. But that’s a drop in the bucket for ‘job protection,’ and may not dissuade many H-1B applicants. At this juncture, it’s hard to say if the White House and DHS are chipping away at a perceived problem and trying to make good on a campaign promise, or doing just enough to ward off criticism. [Without actual action and sweeping policy change](https://insights.dice.com/2017/11/01/h-1b-reform-lingers-trump-white-house/), some may think it smacks of the latter.

#### H-4 women don’t know about U-visas

Indian women continue to be abused in the US." *Rediff.com*. n.d. Web. 30 Mar. 2018. <http://www.rediff.com/news/2003/mar/08spec.htm>

For these women, health, legal, financial and housing options are extremely limited. Many of them are highly qualified doctors or computer professionals, but are unable to work legally, unless they obtain sponsorship from an employer. Economic dependence prevents these women from breaking free. Besides, they are not able to access public benefits, and emergency shelter stays are limited. There is now a new provision in the Violence Against Women Act, the U visa, which can help abused women. But many of them do not know about it or are too scared to call the police. Citizens or green card holders do not face these particular problems but, many times, are still too traumatised to attempt escape the abuse.

#### Indian have a stigma for divorce

Anahita Mukherji. "A chilling video clip reminds Indians in Silicon Valley that domestic abuse is not uncommon." *Scroll.in*. 29 Apr. 2017. Web. 30 Mar. 2018. <https://scroll.in/article/835734/domestic-abuse-is-common-among-indians-in-silicon-valley-a-chilling-video-is-more-proof-of-this>

A number of immigrant women who come to the United States cannot drive and nobody helps them get a licence. This makes them virtually immobile. Also, many women facing abuse are on an H4 visa for dependents of those on an H-1B visa, and are not allowed to work. They might be engineers in India, but in the United States, they are forced to become housewives. This increases the financial control a man has over his wife, according to Nimbalkar. There are also instances where women do find jobs, but their husbands take away the money they earn. Nimbalkar’s experience in the field shows her that partners aren’t the only ones responsible for a woman facing domestic violence. A woman’s extended family, some of whom may not even live in the United States, may be responsible for the perpetuation of the abuse she suffers. Often a woman’s in-laws complain to her parents about how she is not making their son happy. The threat is particularly sinister in a patriarchal society where divorce is taboo. “Americans don’t have the sort of cultural and social stigma around divorce that we see in our culture,” said Nimbalkar.

#### Many women unaware of rights and VAWA

N.a. "The Sunday Tribune - Spectrum." *Tribuneindia.com*. 3 Dec. 2014. Web. 30 Mar. 2018. <http://www.tribuneindia.com/2014/20140720/spectrum/main1.htm>

EVERY year we export herds of made-in-Punjab brides to the United States. For many it does lead to living "The American Dream" and yet there are a large number of women who end up living through the horrific nightmare of domestic violence, social isolation and torture by their husbands and in-laws. The VAWA — or Violence Against Women Act — empowers women who migrate to America on a dependent or H4 visa. However, most of them are not even aware of their legal rights. A trip to two American shelter homes in San Francisco, California and Atlanta, Georgia, revealed how these women, battered by abusive spouses, suffered silently while their husbands preyed on their ignorance.

#### 25 to 70 years for a Green Card

Trisha Thadani. "Green card backlog puts lives in, on the line." *San Francisco Chronicle*. 5 Feb. 2018. Web. 31 Mar. 2018. <https://www.sfchronicle.com/business/article/Green-card-backlog-puts-lives-in-on-the-line-12550838.php>

The workers also spoke of the daunting reality that if their H-1B visas didn’t get renewed, they would suddenly need to leave the U.S., taking young kids back to countries they hardly know. Some have been here for 10, 15, 20 years, with no green card in sight. According to a [study](https://nfap.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/Understanding-American-Legal-Immigration-System.NFAP-Policy-Brief.December-2017-1.pdf) by the National Foundation for American Policy, at the current rate, Indians with just a bachelor’s degree might have to wait anywhere from 25 to 70 years.

#### Laws to deter domestic violence aren’t useful

Shepard M.. "Addressing Domestic Violence Against Women: An Unfinished Agenda." *PubMed Central (PMC)*. Wolters Kluwer -- Medknow Publications, n.d. Web. 30 Mar. 2018. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2784629/>

In January, India implemented its first law aimed at tackling domestic violence (The Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act, 2005) to protect the rights of women who are victims of violence of any kind occurring within the family and to provide for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto. It also defines repeated insults, ridiculing or name-calling, and demonstrations of obsessive possessiveness and jealousy of a partner as domestic violence. The big challenge in front now is to enforce it in true sense. “A law is as good as its implementability, despite the lofty aspirations. The responses to the enactment are polarized, with one section fearing its misuse by an elite class in metro cities and another segment predicting its futility for the mass of rural women saddled with the yoke of patriarchy to which courts are as yet alien” (Flavia Agnes)([13](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2784629/#CIT13)) A bill alone will not help in preventing domestic abuse; what is needed is a change in mindsets. Concerted and coordinated multisectoral efforts are key methods of enacting change and responding to domestic violence at local and national levels. The Millennium Development Goal regarding girls' education, gender equality and the empowerment of women reflects the international community's recognition that health, development, and gender equality issues are closely interconnected. Hence the responses to the problem must be based on integrated approach. The effectiveness of measures and initiatives will depend on coherence and coordination associated with their design and implementation. The issue of domestic violence must be brought into open and examined as any other preventable health problem, and best remedies available be applied.

## F2: India Worse

#### They say spouses would be worse off in India, but they are ignoring the unique power H-1B gives over the H-4 spouses life. In India, they can escape the marriage and find other jobs, but in America if they separate from their abuser they get deported.

## F2: Trump’s Regulations

## F2: Exploitation

## F2: Trump Crackdown solving

#### Sure, Trump said he would crackdown on companies hiring lower wage workers, but he said that over a year ago. He hasn’t made any actions to enforce this so called crackdown. Make them provide you examples of the government enforcing this rule, or we can assume its just rhetoric.

## F2: They Hire because they need – not lower wages.

#### They say that the companies aren’t hiring them for the lower wages, but because they need the workers, but Leef of Forbes finds that the US has a surplus of science and engineering graduates. If they need more workers, why aren’t they hiring domestically? Its because they can pay H-1B workers tens of thousands of dollars less than the average American worker or they can outsource the job for even cheaper labor.

## F2: Profitability – New Regulations

#### These new regulations weren’t passed, just proposed. They are still paid only 60k when the average silicon valley wage is 100k

## F2: Not Paid Less – statistics

#### Two problems with their studies:

#### It compares it to the average earnings of all Americans, many of which are working minimum wage jobs – something not at all comparable to a Silicon Valley job, and

#### Their studies compare a prevailing wage to come to their conclusion, meaning you are comparing Silicon Valley tech jobs to Iowa tech jobs – something that is clearly going to have a large pay differential.

#### That’s why you are preferring our analysis from Sperry 17 from Bryn Mawr University, the latest study on wages and H-1B workers, where he concludes using not only prevailing wages, but also the skill level of immigrants and the state they work in and finds conclusively that H-1B workers are underpaid in every occupation besides banking.

*Scholarship.tricolib.brynmawr.edu*. 21 Feb. 2018. Web. 8 Apr. 2018. <https://scholarship.tricolib.brynmawr.edu/bitstream/handle/10066/19254/2017SperryW.pdf?sequence=1>

Overall, I found that H1B workers are underpaid in computer, life and social science occupations and engineering, but overpaid in banking jobs. H1B violators paid less than the overall H1B employers in most of the datasets, but not all, and the “other” prevailing wage option was lower than the OES survey in most, but not all as well

## F2: Increased Cap Solves Body Shopping

#### They say increasing the cap would solve the body shopping but never explain why. Logically, increasing the cap would just make these problems worse because companies want infinitely more cheap labor. Their card just says that a low cap creates a high demand for body shopping, but doesn’t ever explain why this demand would go away with a higher cap. They will always want cheaper labor, the demand wont go away.

## F2: Tata and Infosys Settlements = solving

#### They say that settlements were reached before with the outsourcing companies, so the problem is solving itself, but that settlement was before 2016, and they have been sued as well In 2006. If these lawsuits created progress, where is the progress. 12 years after the first lawsuit, we have seen no change whatsoever, so it is obviously not solving.

## F2: They chose to come here

#### Turn- that’s only what companies want them to think, however after they come here they regret it. But just because they chose to come here doesn’t mean that the United States federal government should continue to expand on this program that is largely flawed. By affirming this resolution, you would only be adding on to the abuse of H1B workers. As American policy makers, we need to be debating from the perspective that all men and women are created equal, and just because the affirmation claims that they come here because conditions are better as compared to their native country, it still doesn’t mean that it is justified for them to be treated in such abusive manners. It just isn’t right! AND UNLESS WE HAVE MORE REGULATIONS ON THIS HIGHLY ABUSIVE SYSTEM, WE SHOULD NOT ABUSE MORE H1B WORKERS.

# F2: Pro

## F2: Skilled Workers

## F2: No need for skilled workers/No demand

#### Beach of the Wall Street Journal 16 explains that 73% of CEOs claim the skill gap is a “key concern” impacting the future growth of their business. He furthers that the for the past five years, businesses have struggled to find the right talent for their jobs, in result threatening business growth and jeopardizing productivity.

#### National Foundation for American Policy 2010- The demand was always high historically and it remains high up to this point.

#### Abby of Washington Post 2010 – Regardless of this hardships and restrictions imposed upon the companies hiring H1B workers, big companies continually push for an opportunity to hire more workers. Therefore even if the demand drops due to restrictions, the companies will still push for change to increase it.

#### Herbst of Business Week – Any drops in demand are short term and the demand quickly recovers once the economy bounces back to normal. In fact, unless another Great Depression happens the trend in the increase in demand will continue.

National Foundation for American Policy 10’(non-partisan public policy research organization, March 2010, http://www.nfap.com/pdf/1003h1b.pdf)  AJR

The demand for skilled foreign nationals has generally been so high and the quota so low that it has created problems for employers. During a one-week filing window in April 2008, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) received 163,000 H-1B applications, nearly twice as many petitions as slots available under the FY 2009 quota of 65,000, plus 20,000 for advanced degree holders from U.S. universities. The petitions were awarded to employers by lottery and no new H-1B petitions could be issued the remainder of the fiscal year. Even when the economy is uncertain, employers still seek talented people on an ongoing basis. Moreover, even firms that downsize in one part of a company may be hiring in another part.

(Abby; Staff Writer WaPo; 5/11/10; Immigration policy critical for tech firms; Coalition supports provision to ease hiring of skilled foreigners; Lexis) BHB

Peter Muller is the director of government relations for Intel, one of the largest sponsors of H-1B temporary visas for skilled workers. The company was approved for 723 new H-1B visas in 2009. Muller said Intel had been hindered in hiring and keeping the most qualified people by the annual caps on H-1B visas and the sometimes decade-long delay in processing applications for green card. "To not be able to hire the people who really drive innovation in our company is a frustration," he said. In past years, the allotment of H-1B visas often was gone within days after the application period opened in April. Last year, it took until December to hit the cap. Even with a slower economy reducing demand for workers, however, tech companies say they want the system overhauled. "Companies are still hiring, so fixing the problems and fixing the system is important," said Jessica Herrera-Flanigan, the co-executive director of Compete America, a coalition of companies that is lobbying for more high-skilled immigration. "It's an issue today for some companies, and it's going to continue to be an issue that needs to be addressed."

 (Moira Herbst; Business Week; http://www.businessweek.com/bwdaily/dnflash/content/nov2009/db2009112\_270880.htm) BHB

Outsourcing companies that have been among the top users of the H-1B visa program for highly skilled workers say a dip in demand for the program won't last. As of Oct. 25, employers had filed about 72,800 H-1B visa petitions for 2009, leaving more than 12,000 still available some six months after the U.S. government started accepting applications. That's a marked contrast from recent years, when companies snapped up the 85,000 available visas within days of their Apr. 1 offer date. But the rush for H-1B visas will return as the economy recovers, especially among outsourcing firms that are now the program's heaviest users, say tech industry experts. "Unless we are heading into a Great Depression, pressure on the H-1B visa program will increase as the economy rebounds," says Peter Bendor-Samuel, founder of the Everest Group, an outsourcing consulting firm in Dallas. "It's almost impossible for me to believe demand [for H-1Bs] will lessen long term. I find it mildly surprising there are some extras left now."

Beach, Gary. “The Skills Gap is No Laughing Matter”, The Wall Street Journal, Oct 5 2016, https://blogs.wsj.com/cio/2016/10/05/the-skills-gap-is-no-laughingmatter/

“With 5.9 million “open” jobs in America, the most unfilled positions ever reported by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, rest assured C-level executives are not laughing about the skills gap. The 2015 PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP’s “Global CEO Survey” reports 73% of CEOs claim the skills gap is a “key concern” impacting the future growth of their business. A perspective recently reflected in the 2016 Hays Global Skills Index which proclaimed, “for the fifth consecutive year businesses across the world continue to struggle to find and attract the right talent, with the lack of skills threatening business growth and jeopardizing productivity.”

## F2: Surplus of Americans with PHDs

#### Sargent 17 of the CRS reports that with globalization and digitalization, a STEM shortage is looming in the next few years.

#### Even if you don’t buy that, Sargent also reports that more scientists and engineers are needed regardless of a shortage or surplus, since a more educated workforce has historically improved the quality of employment and speed of economic performance and innovation.

#### Their evidence says that many people have STEM degrees but aren’t being employed but realize that this is because they chose a different job in a different sector. It isn’t that these people are searching for an IT job, but that they found better jobs.

#### Regardless of an overhaul of Americans, these immigrants bring us more patents and ideas that end in new products. That’s why these companies are hiring because they don’t just sell in the US and need to make it abroad as well through differing ideas and people who come from different living conditions.

“The U.S. Science and Engineering Workforce: Recent, Current, and Projected Employment, Wages, and Unemployment” John F. Sargent Jr. Specialist in Science and Technology Policy November 2, 2017 https://fas.org/sgp/crs/misc/R43061.pdf

Here are some general ways in which their views may be expressed: • There is a shortage. There is a shortage (or a looming shortage) of scientists and engineers (or alternatively, an inadequate supply of workers with degrees in science and engineering fields), and this may result in the loss of U.S. scientific, engineering, technological, and industrial leadership, with consequent effects on areas such as economic growth, job creation, standard of living, and national security.22 • There is not a shortage. Assertions of a broad shortage of scientists and engineers are not supported by the data when considering indicators such as employment growth, wage growth, and unemployment rates.23 **• More scientists and engineers are needed regardless of the existence of a shortage. Historically, federal policies, programs, and investments have contributed to the development of the United States’ scientific and engineering workforce. Regardless of whether demand currently exceeds supply, increasing the number of U.S. scientists and engineers will increase U.S. innovation, economic performance, and job creation. Even if there is not a shortage of scientists and engineers, jobs in many occupations require a higher level of STEM knowledge than ever before.**24 Students who earn S&E degrees gain thinking skills, problem-solving skills, and STEM knowledge that will enable them to be successful not only in S&E occupations, but also in S&E-related careers and in non-S&E fields where they can apply their S&E knowledge and skills.25

## F2: Rural Medicine

## F2: India Shortage

#### They say that India has a massive shortage, but a lower cap doesn’t keep them in India. If they cant come to the US, they normally go to other countries. Bhatt 18 reports that Canada has a six times h1b rate than the US, showing that Indians wont stay in India anyway, so let them come to a country where they want to be AND WHERE THEY ARE NEEDED.

Ananya Bhattacharya, 2-26-2018, "Indian techies look to Canada as the American Dream turns into an H-1B nightmare," Quartz, <https://qz.com/1215625/the-h-1b-nightmare-has-turned-indian-techies-onto-the-canadian-dream/>

The [point-based system](http://immigrationcanada.pro/immigrate/eligibility-of-h-1b-visa-holders-to-move-to-canada/) awards people for their level of education, work experience, and language ability in either English or French. “Many H-1B workers in the US will be ideal candidates for Express Entry, as H-1B workers will excel in all of these areas,” immigration law firm Allen and Hodgman [writes](http://allhod.com/canada-immigration/canadian-alternatives-for-h-1b-workers-in-the-u-s/).

Canada currently admits [far more high-skilled workers](https://www.canada.ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/corporate/publications-manuals/annual-report-parliament-immigration-2017.html#sec1_1) than the US—one permanent skilled visa for every 409 Canadian residents in 2016, nearly [six times more](https://www.dhs.gov/immigration-statistics/yearbook/2016/table6) per capita than the US, Richard Burke, CEO of immigration platform Envoy Global, told Quartz.

“Personally I feel it’s game over for the masters-H-1B-green card path used by so many Indians to build a life in the US. The wait time for getting a green card is over 20 years. This makes it as good as never,” Rangnekar said.

## F2: Medscape

#### When the card states that an influx of doctors is going to reduce quality of care and balloon costs its talking about an influx in urban areas where doctors already are, not rural areas where the shortages exist and H1B workers are being recruited. The card itself is predicated on the idea that the Association of American Medical Colleges would fund more doctors who as American citizens seeking wealth, would choose urban areas – H1Bs do not have this choice.

Eric J. Topol, MD, editor-in-chief of Medscape, and Ezekiel Emanuel, MD, PhD, chair of the Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy at the University of Pennsylvania, explains on January 24th, 2018 “No Physician Shortage Despite Dire Warnings: Zeke Emanuel" [https://www.medscape.com/viewarticle/891569] Accessed 4/11/18 SAO

Dr Topol: There is a maldistribution issue. One fifth of the American population is in rural areas, and adding more doctors does not seem to be the fix for that, right? Dr Emanuel: Right. If you were an economist, you would say, "We've got to get supply to equal demand, so we will just make more docs and force them out of New York City or San Francisco and they will go to North Dakota." But we know that is garbage. No country with big rural populations has ever solved maldistribution this way due to the fact that highly trained doctors do not want to relocate to small, rural cities. It's not just the United States. The main reason is because they want a lot of the social amenities that come along with a high socioeconomic status. These tend to be located in larger, urban areas, and getting this very talented pool out into rural areas is just not going to happen unless you literally force them, and we are against forcing doctors. I do not think more doctors are going to solve that maldistribution problem, and so we need to address this by adding more allied healthcare professionals, using telemedicine, and finding other ways of linking rural populations with physicians at more urban centers. That is especially true for specialty care. Here we might have a genuine shortage, but that is of a different kind. There may not be enough pediatric cardiologists or pediatric rheumatologists, but they are never going to be in North Dakota. That is a problem you are only going to solve by changing the amount that we reimburse them and linking them when patients need their services in rural areas by telemedicine or MD-MD consults via the Web. Serving the rural patient population is a hard nut to crack, but it's not going to be solved by training more docs. Wait Times Linked to Scheduling, Not Physician Supply Dr Topol: Another metric used a lot is wait times. Wait times to see a primary care doctor in places like Boston are more than 6 weeks, and the average is well over 3 weeks for the United States. Since wait times have been creeping up, the idea is that we do not have enough doctors. What are your thoughts about that? Dr Emanuel: It is very interesting. They looked at wait times after Massachusetts expanded access. A large part of the fear was that if you add millions of new people with health insurance and you are not adding doctors to cover them, wait times will go up. There was no evidence that that was true. Despite the fact that we added 22 million Americans through the ACA, I do not know that anyone has seen general wait times around the country go up. Wait time is not a function of doctor supply; it is a function of how you manage doctor time. I went around the country looking at places that provide high-quality, low-cost care, and one of the things I noticed is that they have "open-access scheduling." At the start of the day, between 20% and 50% of the physicians' slots are open and unscheduled so that patients can walk in or call and say, "I have some free time. Can I see my primary care doctor and get my annual exam?" That management style, ironically, opens up additional free time in doctor schedules because you have fewer no-shows. A lot of mechanisms can reduce wait time. Your old institution, the Cleveland Clinic, went to same-day appointments, and last year I think they did a million same-day appointments. Open-access scheduling, getting people in on the same day, and fixing the no-show issue can increase efficiency and decrease wait times. Supply Induces Demand in Healthcare Dr Topol: That brings up the issue of healthcare costs. After hospitals, the next line item of the $3.4 trillion in healthcare costs (or whatever it is right now) is docs. The concern is: If we increase the number of doctors like the AAMC is ordering up, are we going to increase costs? Dr Emanuel: Economists like to say that supply equals demand, and if we have this big demand of a billion office visits and these long wait times, we need to increase supply and things will even out. We know that in healthcare, supply and demand do not work that way. We have "supply-induced demand," which is how often you are supposed to see a diabetic patient in follow-up, for example. There is no evidence-based guideline. You have a lot of doctors chasing diabetic patients. Doctors will see more patients and increase costs with no added benefit. We have seen this over and over again. Florida has very high utilization because they have a lot of doctors down there for the old people and too many doctors given the population. You end up with very high utilization and very high costs. But there is no evidence that it leads to better care and some evidence that it actually leads to worse care because you are giving people unnecessary care and inefficiently delivered care. One doctor who practices down there and runs a capitated system responsible for total cost of care says that what you end up seeing is relatively small community hospitals with 70 cardiologists on staff who are doing all sorts of unnecessary catheterizations, pacemakers, and other things on marginal cases. He says this drives up costs because there is a big supply of doctors who produce a lot of unnecessary care because they need to meet a certain income threshold. That is not a place to be. We made that mistake. In the 1970s, Richard Nixon thought that by increasing the number of medical schools and doctors, healthcare costs would go down. The effect is exactly the opposite: If you increase the number of doctors, you will increase healthcare costs because they write prescriptions and order services like x-rays. That is not a good way of approaching the problem.

## F2: Can Enter Legally Using J1

#### The J1 has absolutely nothing to do with working in the United States. According to Oregon State University, the purpose of this visa is so foreign candidates can teach, study, demonstrate special skills, or receive on the job training. “As a non-immigrant visa type, all exchange visitors are expected to return to their home country upon completion of their program”.

## F2: Enough Domestic Doctors

#### If this was true, why is there a shortage right now? Its because even when they are unemployed, they aren’t willing to move away from big cities into rural areas. These immigrants are willing to be in the rural environments, making them a valuable resource.

## F2: 5% isn’t a lot

#### They say only 5% go into the medical field but realize that that is very significant and will get more and more significant. 5% of the 85,000 cap is 4,250 meaning 4,250 immigrants every year come to work in the medical field on average. The more we increase it, the more we allow into the rural fields.

85,000 \* .05 = 4250

## BL2: Must go through H1B holder

#### H4 to EAD, a website that assists these women through the legal process, explains that in order to get a U-visa, all the women need is substantial evidence of the abuse occurring and information to aid in the investigation of the individual who abused them. They do not have to have any legal documentation from the H1B holder and are not limited by them. If they have the proof, they can receive a U-visa.

Posted By, 2-23-2016, "How can an H4 visa holder use a U visa.," No Publication, <http://www.h4toead.com/2016/02/h4-and-u-visa.html>

In order to submit the petition for such a visa, the person should have suffered substantial physical or mental abuse due to a criminal activity in certain pre-specified categories. These categories are- sexual assault, domestic violence, rape, trafficking, kidnapping, torture, female genital mutilation, prostitution, incest, abusive sexual contact, sexual exploitation, hostage situations, peonage, extortion, slave trade, false imprisonment, involuntary servitude, perjury or attempt, conspiracy, abduction, blackmail, manslaughter, murder, felonious assault, witness tampering, obstruction of justice, unlawful criminal restraint, or solicitation to commit any of the mentioned crimes.

Once your U visa petition is approved, it automatically grants the applicant work eligibility in the US. Henceforth an Employment Authorization Document is included with all approved petitions, which may be shown to any employer to obtain a Social Security Number in order to be able to start work legally.
A petition for a U Visa must include information on how the victim can assist government officials in tackling crime as well as helping the authorities in matters related to investigation and/or prosecution of the individual(s) who might have committed the crime, against them.

While the U visa is a powerful tool for those on H4 visas holders who are victims of domestic violence, we should not ignore the other use of the U visa. For example, one can be victim of assault or some other crimes and ultimately qualify for a U visa. If you think you are victim of a crime, make sure you report it to the authorities and call a good immigration lawyer to help, it might actually be a ticket to your permanent residence.